

# **Globalization, Identity Politics and Crisis of Governance in the Post-New Order Indonesia: A Three Pillars of Public Administration Perspective**

**Yuliani, Sri**

Department of Public Administration, Sebelas Maret University, Surakarta, Indonesia

---

## ***Abstract***

*Globalization as an ideology is identical with Western democratic values: freedom, liberalism, individualism, human right, multiculturalism and pluralism. Identity politics is getting stronger as the form of defense against global cultural values domination. Conflicts of individuals or groups that are triggered by differences in identity: religion, ethnicity, and culture which is really a question of private affairs easily develop into a public or political issue. The phenomenon of stronger identity politics also occurred in Indonesia post-centralistic New Order regime. Identity politics was found in political contestation, policy formulation, and public management. This led to a crisis of governance, because neither central nor local government has sufficient capacity to solve this problem. This article wanted to review globalization and the reinforcement of identity politics in Post-New Order era, the actor and interest involved within it, and government capacity to deal with it. The analysis was limited to three pillars of public administration: identity politics in political domain, public policy and public management.*

**Keywords:** *globalization, identity politics, crisis of governance, post- new order*

*[Do not include author details in the initial submission] Doe, J.; Roe, J.; Smith, J. (authors)*

## **1. Introduction**

Globalization is an integration of nearly all aspects of human life into global scope. From political and cultural aspects, globalization is followed with the diffusion of cultural and political values identical with western values: democratic, freedom, liberalism, individualism, human right appreciation, multiculturalism and pluralism. Globalization as the form of western capitalism, ideology and culture domination is resisted by marginal countries and communities. Identity politics is getting stronger as the form of defense against the spreading of global cultural values. At small scale, individual or group conflict triggered with different belief, perspective and culture actually constituting private problem develops easily into public one. At larger scale, political conflict triggered by different cultural identity becomes global problem such as 9/11, Bali Bomb, recent bomb terror incidences befalling European countries.

Globalization process, according to Castells (2006), runs concomitantly with reaffirmation of various cultural identities: religion, nation, ethnic, locality, gender, and etc. Some scholars – like Huntington (1993) – predicted that global political conflict in post-Cold War era was no longer triggered by political ideology or economic problem, but inter-nation or inter-group conflict with diverse cultures.

The phenomenon of stronger identity politics occurred in Indonesia post-centralistic New Order. The riots with different ethnic and religion background occurred successively in many areas and took more than 10.000 life tolls during 1997-2002 (McDonald, 2013). The phenomenon of stronger identity politics was also found in political contestation, policy formulation, and public management. Neither central nor local government has sufficient capacity to solve this problem.

Furthermore, this article will review the globalization and the reinforcement of identity politics in Post-New Order era, the actor and interest involved within it, and government capacity to deal with it. The analysis was limited to three pillars of public administration: identity politics in political domain, public policy and public management.

## **2. Globalization and Identity Politics**

Globalization can be defined varyingly because it is complex in nature and has many dimensions. Steger (2003) stated that globalization basically refers to the condition of global link and interrelationship, particularly politically, economically, culturally and environmentally making the area borders no longer relevant. Globalization can exert both positive and negative effects. Farazmand (1999) stated that globalization builds the foundation a new civilization signed by many paradoxes. All of countries are exposed to

*[Do not include author details in the initial submission] Doe, J.; Roe, J.; Smith, J. (authors)*

globalization effect, but individual countries' ability or readiness to respond differently to those effects. In other words, the effect generated by globalization is not universal.

The analysis on the effect of globalization so far largely focuses on economic and political effects. But, cultural effect of globalization has not been explored well. Cultural conflict is just already realized in World Trade Center destruction incidence on September 9, 2001 or known as 9/11 incidence. From cultural aspect, globalization is a cultural or global lifestyle diffusing agent through consumption of capitalism product (food, fashion, entertainment, and etc) and democratic political culture spreading liberalism and secularism. Western cultural domination results in feeling of being threatened because it worryingly will threat the existence of "indigenous culture". As the form of defense mechanism, counter culture will arise in the form of the movement "back to traditional values or local cultural identity". This condition triggers the reinforcement of identity politics and anti-western, anti liberalism, anti-democracy, and anti Human Rights movements. Eriksen (1999) stated that Post-Cold War is characterized with the rising of identity politics aiming to restore traditional and religious values and bonding with ethnic and nation identity. This movement's objective resists the globalization process threatening local peculiarity. Politics in 1990s was characterized with strong identity politics.

Identity politics (Thiel and Coate, 2010) can be defined broadly as a political action oriented to fulfilling needs, values and interests of certain groups with the same identity. Castells (1997) formulated identity as the meaning constructing process based on cultural characteristics making an individual find the meaning of their life objective. Identity politics, according to Eriksen (1999) can be utilized as a medium of intergroup competition in competing for scarce resource as well, because it can be an efficacious strategy to build exclusivity and resentment ideology. Somehow, identity politics is the product of modernity. Strong emotion in tradition, culture, and religion cannot be mobilized unless the people feel under stressed or marginalized condition.

### ***3. Identity Politics and Crisis of Governance in Post New Order Indonesia: A Three Pillars of Public Administration Perspective***

The analysis on identity politics in post-New Order era in this article is limited to three public administrative pillars: politic, public policy, and management. The classification of three pillars is made based on public administration dimension according to Rosenbloom's classification (in Shafritz and Hyde, 1997). Zalmanovitch (2014: 6) conceive of the identity of public administration as based on the mutual existence of and interaction among the three pillars. Each of the three addresses as essential function : what may be achieved (politics), how it may be attained (management), and under what strictures, limitations and rules (legality)

#### **3.1. Politics**

[Do not include author details in the initial submission] Doe, J.; Roe, J.; Smith, J. (authors)

Political order in post-New Order is relatively more democratic as characterized with the enactment of multi-parties system and direct election for regents since 2005. Identity politics strengthened in this era inseparable from political elite's interest needing people's vote. In the campaign of local government election in Indonesia, cultural identity often shown off includes ethnic, religion, and locality (McDonald, 2013).

In many Indonesian areas, religion-based identity politics is sufficiently successful to achieve power. Here there is mutualism symbiosis between political and religion interests. For example, the case of Cianjur Regent during 2001-2006, Wasidi Swastomo established sharia-nuanced local regulation as the performance of promise during campaign. Wasidi Swastomo is the only nominee promising to enact "Islamic Law (*syariat Islam*)" openly when he was elected to be regent. (Mudzakkir, 2009; Eddyono, 2010; Suaedy, ). Sri Hartati, the member of Banten Province's Local Legislative Assembly (DPRD) states that the application of shari'a by laws is the form of "logrolling" practice between executive and local religion leaders in raising political support. (<http://www.kemendagri.go.id/article/2015/03/10/sangat-berbahaya-jika-setiap-daerah-terbitkan-perda-berbasis-agama>).

Buehler (2007) stated that shari'a by laws indicate changing patterns of power accumulation and political corruption in Indonesia local politics. Direct elections led to a shift of political corruption which was originally concentrated in the military and bureaucratic elite now spread to organizations and community leaders (Buehler, 2007)., While according to Eddyono (2010) syariah by law is a kind of politization of Islam movement entering through a democratic mechanism. There is such paradox here, that is, globalization leads to the demand for democratizing political order in Indonesia, but ironically primordial identity sentiment is used to win the democratic political competition.

### **3.2. Public Policy**

Post- New Order regime is characterized with the application of local autonomy giving the local government the authority of establishing local regulations. One of public issues considered as urgent is social disease problem thereby bringing about many local regulations based on morality and religion (shari'a). Starting from 1999-2000 identified approximately 7 religiously tinged policy, the era from 2001 to 2005 similar policies has increased to approximately 84 pieces and in 2009 it increased to 154 policy (Eddyono, 2010; Muhtada, 2014). Identity politics in public policy is also found in local regulations making women the object of control. Komisi Nasional Anti Kekerasan terhadap Perempuan (National Commission for Women, 2015) noted many religion-nuanced local regulations governing women behavior. From 2009 to October 2015, there were 389 discriminative policies, 322 of which impacts directly on women life (138 policies discriminating women, 39 policies governing personal space and relation, 100 policies about dressing compellation, 39 governing night hour, 15 governing women mobility) and 54 limited the guarantee for the citizen's freedom of religious life.

*[Do not include author details in the initial submission] Doe, J.; Roe, J.; Smith, J. (authors)*

Riyas Rasyid stated that it is very dangerous when each area publish religion or sharia-based Local Regulation, because it will trigger inter-religion conflict. The real example is the inter-religion members' tension related to the construction of worship place and religious understanding. Religious affairs, according to Rasyid, are actually not the local government's affairs, but the central government's. For that reason, central government, through Ministry of Home Affairs obligatorily refuses the religion-nuanced local regulation (<http://www.kemendagri.go.id/article/2015/03/10/sangat-berbahaya-jika-setiap-daerah-terbitkan-perda-berbasis-agama>)

However, the chief executives at both central and local levels do not have adequate capacity when they face the religion-nuanced public policy issues. Although statutorily it is in contradiction with the regulation above, many religion-nuanced local regulations are still maintained without firm action to control it. In the response to the religion-nuanced local regulation, the Minister of Home Affairs, Tjahjo Kumolo, confirms that there is no sharia local regulation removed by Ministry of Home Affairs. The sharia local regulation problem is mentioned as local authority. (<http://nasional.kompas.com/read/2016/06/23/07005671/mendagri.tak.ada.pencabutan.perda.intoleransi>)

Religion issue pertaining to religious faith and worship is actually private domain. But this private affairs become the public ones through the organization of local regulations about dressing procedure, prohibition of selling food during fasting, prohibition of doing bad deed and drinking based on religion tenet. In Post-New Order era, all of affairs pertaining to religion become sensitive irresolvable issue due to government's fear of making unpopular policy.

### **3.3.Public Management**

Identity politics in political and legal domain or public policy will have direct implication to the implementation of policy or public management. The case of cultural identity reinforcement in public management is found in Civil Servant personnel management and public service delivery. In Probolinggo, 541 prospect Civil Servants (CPNS) newly accepted in recruitment in February 2009 were obliged to wear veil. They cannot take their salary when they do not wear veil. It is stated that the obligation of wearing veil is non-written rule, but will be their performance note. The obligation of wearing veil has been implemented since 2003. When there are some servants not wearing veil, it will reduce the performance point from religiosity aspect (<http://www.surya.co.id/2009/04/08/cpns-wajib-berjilbab.html>.)

The obligation of wearing veil evidently becomes an efficacious control for the officials to measure bureaucratic compliance below. Meanwhile, there is no correlation at all between veil wearing and local apparatus performance. From subordinate perspective, veil wearing policy becomes the ladder to promote career and position. It is because in a paternalistic hierarchic bureaucratic structure, position promotion and other problems are affected by

*[Do not include author details in the initial submission] Doe, J.; Roe, J.; Smith, J. (authors)*

their behavior. It is surprisingly that those formerly not willing to wear veil will wear veil suddenly.

The veil wearing policy textually intended to Muslimah in fact affects the public service for non-Muslim as well. For example, the regulation of Muslim dress for students throughout Padang City, in reality is enacted to non-Muslim (Tempo Edition 08/XXXVII/14-20 April 2008). More extreme case is found in village houses in Bulukumba ignoring the women's right to receive public service by posting the announcement reading "Catering to Women Wearing Veil Only" (Nawala, The Wahid Institute, 2007). The growing incidence of veiling in the post-New Order era can be understood within the context of the influence of Islamic values and the new decentralisation laws. The dismantling of entrenched authoritarian controls has provided opportunities for democratic development and open forum for cultural and political discussion (Warburton, 2006). Indonesian political system in post-New Order era indeed gives many parties the access to politics, many religion elites successfully occupying political post peak, both in legislative and in executive, contributes to the strengthened identity politics in public management practice in Indonesia.

#### **4. Conclusion**

The reinforcement of identity politics in post-New Order era often occurs as democratic values strengthens as the effect of globalization and information technology and communication development. The centralistic, elitist and closed governance model as applied during New Order regime can no longer be maintained in globalization era requiring transparency, participation and respect to human rights. Closed political succession system based on designation is replaced with opened directly political contestation. An introduction of such democratic system has implication to the identity politics. Viewed from the three pillars of public administration including politic, policy and public management, the identity politics are often interrelated. In political domain, cultural identity is used to obtain electorates' political support. It is here the agreement occurs with society leader, particularly religion leader or religion community organization's leader with large mass base, in which the prospect local leaders promised to establish religion-nuance (sharia) policy when they are elected. Identity politics continue in public management level, particularly personnel management and public services. Because sharia-nuanced public policy is a part of political deal among local rulers, they do not have capacity to deal with the religion-nuanced conflict problem. Both central and local governments are not brave to make decision that can reduce their popularity in the society's eyes. It is that becomes the source of the crisis of governance during post-New Order era. Thus, it can be concluded that globalization exerts both positive and negative effects. Its positive effect includes the reinforcement of democratic values and transparency in political practice and public administration. However, at the same time, identity politic strengthens as well as the means of winning the political contestation in democratic realm.

[Do not include author details in the initial submission] Doe, J.; Roe, J.; Smith, J. (authors)

## References

- Buehler, Michael. (2008). The Rise of Shari'a By Laws in Indonesian Districts ; An Indication for Changing Patterns of Power Accumulation and Political Corruption. *South East Asia Research*. Volume 16, Issue 2, pp.255-285.
- Castells, Manuel. (1997). The Power of Identity. Vol II. *The Information Age : Economy, Society and Culture*. Massachussets : Blackwell Publishers
- (2006). Globalisation and Identity, A Comparative Perspective. [http://lull.cat/IMAGES\\_175/transfer01-foc01.pdf](http://lull.cat/IMAGES_175/transfer01-foc01.pdf)
- CPNS Perempuan di Probolinggo Wajib Berjilbab. <http://www.surya.co.id/2009/04/08/cpns-wajib-berjilbab.html>) Download 12 April 2009
- Eriksen, Thomas Hylland. (1999). *Globalization and the politics of identity*. <http://hyllanderiksen.net/UNChron.html>
- Eddyono, Sri Wiyanti. (2010). Politisasi Islam dalam Transisi Demokrasi : Tantangan baru bagi gerakan perempuan di Indonesia. Consultancy, Research and Education for Social Transformative (SCN-CREST)
- Farazmand, Ali. (1999). Globalization and Public Administration. *Public Administration Review*. Vol.59 No.6 (Nov-Dec 1999) pp 509-522
- Huntington, Samuel H. (1993). The Clash of Civilizations? *Foreign Affairs*, Vol. 72, No. 3 (Summer, 1993), pp. 22-49. <http://online.sfsu.edu/mroozbeh/CLASS/h-607-pdfs/S.Huntington-Clash.pdf>
- Jilbab, Wajib dan Menyesuaikan. 2008. Dimuat di Tempo Edisi 08/XXXVII/14-20 April
- McDonald, Geoffrey. (2013). *Election Rules and Identity Politics : Understanding the Success of Multiethnic Parties in Indonesia*. Washington : International Foundation for Electoral Systems
- Mendagri tak ada pencabutan perda intoleransi. (2016) [http://nasional.kompas.com / read/2016/06/23/07005671/mendagri.tak.ada.pencabutan.perda.intoleransi](http://nasional.kompas.com/read/2016/06/23/07005671/mendagri.tak.ada.pencabutan.perda.intoleransi). Download 25 June 2016
- Mudzakkir, Amin. (2009) . Islam Priangan: Pergulatan Identitas dan Politik Kekuasaan dalam <http://penelitianku.wordpress.com>. Download 12 July 2009
- Muhtada, Dani. (2014). Perda Syariah di Indonesia : Penyebaran, Problem dan Tantangannya. Delivered in a scientific oration in Dies Natalis VII Faculty of Law Universitas Negeri Semarang at 4 Desember 2014 in Semarang.
- Rosenbloom, David. Public Administration Theory and the Separation of Powers in Shafritz, Jay.M & Hyde, Albert .Eds (1997). *Classics of Public Administration*. Fort Worth : Harcourt Brace & Company

[Do not include author details in the initial submission] Doe, J.; Roe, J.; Smith, J. (authors)

- Perda SI Tidak Menyelesaikan Masalah Sosial . <http://www.wahidinstitute.org/Program/Detail/?id=205/perda-si-tidak-menyelesaikan-masalah-sosial>. Download 12 July 2009
- Sangat Berbahaya Jika Setiap Daerah Terbitkan Perda Berbasis Agama. <http://www.kemendagri.go.id/article/2015/03/10/sangat-berbahaya-jika-setiap-daerah-terbitkan-perda-berbasis-agama>. Download 5 July 2016
- Showing True Colours : Identity Politics in Indonesia's Local Elections. <http://blog.crisisgroup.org/asia/2012/10/03/showing-true-colours-identity-politics-in-indonesias-local-elections/>. Download 5 July 2016
- Siaran Pers Dalam Rangka Satu Tahun Pelaksanaan Undang-Undang Nomor 23 Tahun 2014 tentang Pemerintah Daerah dan Peringatan Sumpah Pemuda "Pemerintah Harus Tegas Merawat Kebhinnekaan Negara Bangsa" Jakarta, 28 Oktober 2015. <http://www.komnasperempuan.go.id/siaran-pers-dalam-rangka-satu-tahun-pelaksanaan-undang-undang-nomor-23-tahun-2014-tentang-pemerintah-daerah-dan-peringatan-sumpah-pemuda-pemerintah-harus-tegas-merawat-kebhinnekaan-negara-ban/>. Download 5 July 2016
- Steger, Manfred. (2003). *Globalization, A Very Short Introduction*. New York : Oxford University Press
- Suaedy, A. (2009, June 13-15). Syari'ah regulations and democratic challenges in Indonesia. Paper presented at The 9th Conference of the Asia Pacific Sociological 11 Association *Improving the Quality of Social Life: a challenge for sociology*, Bali, Indonesia.
- Thiel, Markus & Coate, Roger . Identity Politics and Political Identities : Local Expressions in a Globalizing World in Coate, Roger & Thiel, Markus, Eds (2010). *Identity Politics in the Age of Globalization*. Boulder : First Forum Press
- Warburton, Eva. (2006) Private Choice or Public Obligation? Institutional and Social Regimes of Veiling in Contemporary Indonesia. A thesis for the Degree of Honours in Indonesian Studies at The University of Sidney.
- Zalmanovitch, Yair. (2014). Don't reinvent the wheel : the search for an identity for public administration. *International Review of Administration Sciences* published online 9 September 2014. <http://ras.sagepub.com/content/early/2014/09/08/0020852314533456>. Download 5 July 2016